Project ‘Worlds of labour’
field stay in South Africa in March 2023:
First reflections on sample, methodology and content

Jour Fixe of working group A03 /CRC 1342
17th of April 2023
01:30 – 04:00 pm
Autor: Andrea Schäfer
1. Preparation (by author)

- **Document analysis / recherche:**
  - Theoretical overview of cluster structure + power structure approach + configurations of labour relations
  - Indicator overview for SA, IN and partly MX on
    - (a) labour law regulations (WBL)
    - (b) legal segmentation (WOL)
    - (c) collective representation rights (CBR-LRI)
    - (d) International Ratifications of Convention (ILO)
    - (e) Social Protection System (ILO) + labour market indicators (WB, ILO, labour survey)
  - Overview of coll. agreements for SA
  - In depth recherche on regional production cluster and OEMs in South Africa / India

- **Interview material:** development of 2 semi-structured interview guides (unions, employers); flyer, consent form, information letter, pre- and post-script interview form, email template, contact list

- **Pre-interview preparations:** research and contact to suppliers, OEMs, Unions, NGOs, experts etc (all were written to at least twice).; org. of incentives and recording devices
2. Response rate (along the supplier chain, OEMs + manufacturers and suppliers of OE components) for sample of Gauteng cluster

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chain</th>
<th>No. of suppliers contacted (out of)</th>
<th>Response rate (in %)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>OEMs</td>
<td>1 (3)*</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tier 1</td>
<td>5 (21)</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tier 2</td>
<td>2 (8)</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tier 3</td>
<td>0 (2)</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>8</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* One OEM still plending

Note: source for suppliers was https://naacam.org.za/find-a-member/
Source: own description

1 supplier / 1 OEM: management + shop stewards
no response from service providers / to few contacts to service providers
2. 1. Impression of plant sides
## 3. Sample description

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>actors from</th>
<th>No. of interviews</th>
<th>function</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Unions</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Shop stewards, national coordination, legal department, research department, specialists on motor/metal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employer (OEMs/supplier)</td>
<td>9 (1)</td>
<td>CEO, HR officer/head, owner, regional leader</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employer associations</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Project Manager, Executive Trade etc., Executive Director, Executive HR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic experts</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Programm managers, directors of foundations, legal scientists, lawyers, sociologists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGOs</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State actors</td>
<td>(2)</td>
<td>n.n.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total no of interviews</strong></td>
<td><strong>22 (3)</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total no of conversations/partly interviews</strong></td>
<td><strong>10</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: ( ) is still pending
Source: own description
3.1. Supplemental material

- One group discussion on union strategy toward retrenchment
- a discussion of the class action lawsuit against an employer
- an observation of a complaint to the labor court
- an observation of a conciliation of an unfair dismissal (at CCMA)
- Meeting at metro police head office

- **What could I return?**
  - Active participation in Human Rights Day / Hammerskraal
  - Active participation in protest march
3.2. Methodological reflections

- semi-structured interview guide (unions/ employers) have worked /some new questions can be added (normal procedure for hermeneutic circle)

- methodological errors / challenges:
  • questionnaire sent to interviewees by a colleague,
  • data protection regulations not respected by a colleague,
  • use of closed questions by a colleague (informational interview to confirm own hypotheses versus problem-centered interview)
  • trust building processes vs insisting on 3-person interviews with interviewees who fear possible consequences from interview (different methodological perspective by a colleague)
  • different interview situations (2-person interview vs group interviews) and types (face-to-face vs online vs phone)

impact on results has to be considered; division of labour/privileging – power structure within working group needs to be reflected
4. First reflections on possible outcomes

- Insights on the regional production network (RPN) and power structures (PS)

- Insights on employment arrangements/workforce in the industry in RPN - standard employment relationships and transitions to precarious/informal employment relations within the cluster

- Insights on strategies towards compliance/implementations/gaps in employment regulations/law in the industry in RPN/PS

- Insights on strategies on the future transformation of industry in RPN within cluster

  Configurations of strategies of different actors within cluster